

Illinois State University

ISU ReD: Research and eData

Faculty Publications - Accounting

Accounting

2024

Limitations and Potential Dark Sides of Transformational Leadership: The Case of the Founder and Former CEO of Theranos

Wenjuan Guo
Valdosta State University

Junnan Cui
Illinois State University, jcui4@ilstu.edu

Lucy Arendt
St. Norbert College

Jamie O'Brien
St. Norbert College

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ir.library.illinoisstate.edu/fpacct>



Part of the [Leadership Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Guo, W., Cui, J., Arendt, L., & O'Brien, J. (2024). Limitations and Potential Dark Sides of Transformational Leadership: The Case of the Founder and Former CEO of Theranos. *Management Teaching Review*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/23792981241267758>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Accounting at ISU ReD: Research and eData. It has been accepted for inclusion in Faculty Publications - Accounting by an authorized administrator of ISU ReD: Research and eData. For more information, please contact ISUReD@ilstu.edu.

Limitations and Potential Dark Sides of Transformational Leadership: The Case of the Founder and Former CEO of Theranos

Management Teaching Review

1–14

© The Author(s) 2024



Article reuse guidelines:

sagepub.com/journals-permissions

DOI: 10.1177/23792981241267758

journals.sagepub.com/home/mtr

Wenjuan Guo¹, Junnan Cui², Lucy Arendt³,
and Jamie O'Brien³

Abstract

Transformational leadership is widely recognized as an effective leadership style; however, it is important to recognize its potential misuse, where it may serve a leader's self-interests at the expense of others, both inside and outside the organization. In this article, we present an experiential exercise that uses the case of Theranos and its founder and former CEO, Elizabeth Holmes, to highlight the limitations and potential dark sides of transformational leadership. In this exercise, students watch three YouTube videos about Holmes, identify the characteristics of Holmes that match transformational leadership, and discuss issues with her leadership style. This exercise can be used in Introductory Management and Organizational Behavior courses, in-person or virtually. Students who have completed the exercise agree it is effective in teaching the concept of transformational leadership and in fostering active class engagement.

Keywords

transformational leadership, experiential exercise, active learning, engagement

¹Valdosta State University, GA, USA

²Illinois State University, Normal, USA

³St. Norbert College, De Pere, WI, USA

Corresponding Author:

Junnan Cui, Illinois State University, 100 N University St, Normal, IL 61761, USA.

Email: jcui4@ilstu.edu

Transformational leaders “are those who stimulate and inspire followers to both achieve extraordinary outcomes and, in the process, develop their own leadership capacity” (Bass & Riggio, 2006, p. 3). It is an effective leadership style (Bass, 1999; Derue et al., 2011) with positive impacts on followers, including higher job satisfaction, organizational commitment, innovative behaviors, and better task, contextual, and creative performance (Avolio et al., 2004; Pieterse et al., 2010; Wang et al., 2011). In addition, transformational leadership positively influences organizational-level outcomes, including organizational learning, innovation, culture, and performance (García-Morales et al., 2012; Liao & Chuang, 2007; Wang et al., 2011).

One criticism of transformational leadership is that the leader can abuse it for destructive purposes and self-interests, at which point it might be deemed pseudo-transformational leadership (Bailey & Axelrod, 2001; Christie et al., 2011; Howell & Avolio, 1993). Although research shows distinctions between pseudo-transformational and true transformational leaders (Christie et al., 2011), their behaviors may appear similar in practice. O’Reilly and Chatman (2020) argue that narcissistic leadership, which shares traits with transformational leadership (e.g., being good at inspiring followers), can lead to harmful outcomes such as employee stress, unethical behavior, and irrational decision-making as the leader’s motives are self-serving rather than other-directed. For students who will be influenced by leadership and who may become leaders, we believe they should understand the negatives that may lurk behind the positive facade of transformational leadership.

We present Elizabeth Holmes, the founder and former CEO of Theranos, as a leader who may exemplify the potential limitations and dark sides of transformational leadership. Holmes, once lauded as a visionary leader reshaping the landscape of health care technology, misled investors, regulators, and the public about the capabilities of her company’s blood testing technology (Carreyrou, 2018). The Theranos scandal is a sobering reminder of the ethical pitfalls inherent in idealized influence (one of four transformational leadership behaviors). By dissecting the case of Theranos, we aim to deepen students’ understanding of transformational leadership, prompting critical reflection on the balance between inspiration and deception. While Holmes’s actions may cast a shadow on transformational leadership, they also underscore the imperative for aspiring leaders to cultivate ethical awareness and moral integrity. We encourage students to navigate the challenging terrain of leadership with wisdom and ethical acumen. Our approach allows students to develop a nuanced understanding of transformational leadership, recognizing its capacity for positive impact while remaining vigilant against its potential for misuse. This exercise is appropriate for undergraduate courses such as Introductory Management and Organizational Behavior, wherever transformational leadership is discussed. It can also be adapted for virtual settings using video links, documents with prompts, and online discussion boards.

Theoretical Foundation

Leadership can be either transactional or transformational (Burns, 1978). Transactional leadership depends on the economic exchange between leaders and followers, where,

for instance, employees work in exchange for remuneration. Transformational leadership outperforms transactional leadership through the implementation of its four core factors: idealized influence, inspirational motivation, intellectual stimulation, and individual consideration (Bass, 1985). Idealized influence reflects a leader's adherence to strong ethical standards, positioning them as a role model for their followers (Bass & Riggio, 2006). Inspirational motivation involves inspiring and energizing followers, for example, by communicating a compelling vision. Leaders use intellectual stimulation to encourage innovation and creativity among followers, prompting them to think critically and propose novel solutions to problems. Individual consideration encompasses an empathetic approach toward understanding and addressing the needs and emotions of followers. Appendix A offers a detailed description of transformational leadership.

In some cases, transformational leaders may be better described as pseudo-transformational. Bass and Steidlmeier (1999) suggest the differences are grounded in the moral foundation of leaders' choices and actions. For example, while pseudo-transformational leaders are skilled at communicating compelling visions, their intent may be self-interested (Barling et al., 2008). Pseudo-transformational leadership negatively affects both followers and organizations. It contributes to fear of the leader, obedience to the leader, dependence on the leader, perceived abusive supervision, and perceived job insecurity (Barling et al., 2008). When followers perceive their leaders as pseudo-transformational, they are less likely to identify with the company, negatively impacting their contextual performance (Lin et al., 2017).

Although transformational leadership has been well researched, it can be difficult for students to understand (Boyd, 2009). Students gain a deeper understanding of concepts when they study real-life examples (Williams & Rosser, 2008). Using the case of Holmes can help students comprehend transformational leadership's four key factors as well as its potential limitations and negative aspects.

Learning Objectives

Students should be able to:

1. Define transformational leadership.
2. Describe the four factors of transformational leadership.
3. Apply the concept of transformational leadership in organizational contexts.
4. Identify aspects of an individual's leadership style.
5. Identify the limitations and potential dark sides of transformational leadership.

Instructions for Running the Exercise

Overview

Much has been written about Elizabeth Holmes and Theranos, perhaps most effectively in the book *Bad Blood: Secrets and Lies in a Silicon Valley Startup* (Carreyrou,

2018). Instructors may wish to require or recommend this book. In addition to or in place of reading the book, we ask students to watch three YouTube videos and discuss several questions. Appendix B includes detailed descriptions of the videos. The in-class exercise lasts about 50 to 60 minutes, depending on the time allocated for each of four discussion questions (Appendix D). The activity can be adjusted for shorter classes by either substituting the video(s) with the text in Appendix C or eliminating Video 2 altogether. The activity can be altered for distance learning by prompting students to watch each of the assigned videos and then respond individually or in a group to the discussion questions (Appendix D) by a specific deadline.

Research suggests that using YouTube videos promotes active learning (Varma, 2020) and creates an engaging educational experience (Berk, 2009; Granitz et al., 2021; Seemiller et al., 2020). One limitation of using YouTube videos is they are uploaded by users and may become unavailable. Although this exercise's videos are owned by media companies (CBS Mornings, 2015; CNBC, 2015; 60 Minutes, 2022) that may be more reliable than individual users, we cannot eliminate this limitation. If the videos become unavailable on YouTube, we recommend using the text in Appendix C.

Introducing Transformational Leadership—10 Minutes

- [If the class is less than 60 minutes, consider completing this first step in a previous class.] Explain the concept of transformational leadership including its four factors.
- Assign two to three students to a group; give each group the discussion questions.
- Ask students to address the first discussion question (Appendix D).

Understanding the Four Factors vis-à-vis Elizabeth Holmes—15 Minutes (5-Minute 51-Second Video)

- Watch “Youngest Self-Made Female Billionaire Takes High-Tech Approach to Blood Testing” (Video Example 1 in Appendix B) in class.
- Ask students to address the second discussion question (Appendix D).
- After the small group discussion, assign and ask each group to address only one of the four transformational behaviors. It is OK to have multiple groups addressing each one of the four behaviors.

Understanding the Potential Dark Sides of Transformational Leadership vis-à-vis Elizabeth Holmes—25 to 35 Minutes (9-Minute 31-Second Video and 14-Minute 2-Second Video)

- Watch “Theranos CEO Elizabeth Holmes: Firing Back at Doubters| Mad Money| CNBC” (Video Example 2 in Appendix B) to understand concerns about Theranos's technology.

- Ask students to evaluate Holmes's leadership and address the third discussion question (Appendix D). Give student groups 5 to 7 minutes to reflect and then ask each group to share one answer with the larger class.
- Watch "Elizabeth Holmes & The Theranos Deception | 60 Minutes Archive" (Video Example 3 in Appendix B).
- Give students 5 to 7 minutes to discuss possible limitations or dark sides of transformational leadership, answer the fourth discussion question (Appendix D), and share one of their answers with the class.

Debriefing

We recommend debriefing this exercise by section. First, we ask students to describe an example of real-life transformational leadership, thereby satisfying the exercise's first and second learning objectives. Instructors can ask several groups to describe a transformational leader and explain what that leader does to exemplify the four factors of transformational leadership. Instructors may need to correct or redirect if students incorrectly match leader behaviors to the four factors.

Second, we introduce students to Elizabeth Holmes. After watching the first video, we ask students to describe and analyze her leadership using the four factors of transformational leadership. The second question in Appendix D addresses the exercise's second and third learning objectives. We ask which of the four factors Holmes best portrayed versus portrayed the least, followed by whether the evidence supports Holmes as a transformational leader and why or why not.

Third, students watch a video where questions and concerns are raised about Theranos's technology, and Holmes responds to the concerns. We ask students to evaluate Holmes's responses via the third discussion question in Appendix D, which addresses the fourth learning objective. We ask why people complied with Holmes's expectations and demands for as long as they did, thus highlighting some challenges of identifying ineffective or unethical leadership, and the biases that may cause us to remain committed to a leader and course of action (e.g., escalating commitment).

After discussing the potential issues, students watch the third video, which reveals the backstory of Theranos and the negative effects of Holmes's leadership style. We ask students to identify the potential limitations or dark sides of transformational leadership in the fourth discussion question, which relates to the fifth learning objective. We ask students what overall lessons they have learned and what they might do in the future to determine if a leader is a pseudo-transformational leader. Then, we emphasize the value of critically evaluating a person's leadership behaviors and style, the importance of understanding the potential limitations or dark sides of transformational leadership (or any leadership style), and the possible impact of our own biases on our perceptions of leaders. We also highlight pseudo-transformational leadership and discuss techniques for determining a leader's intentions and the likelihood they are self-versus other-focused. Being asked by a leader to engage in unethical behavior, such as falsifying data or ignoring regulations, is one clue that a leader's style may be pseudo-transformational. Another might be the lack of authentically positive outcomes for employees and the organization despite being told that everything is fine.

It is a simplification to say that transformational leaders are always ethical and other-focused, while pseudo-transformational leaders are always unethical and self-focused. It is possible for followers to receive positive treatment and outcomes even when leadership is pseudo-transformational. This should be acknowledged, with the caveat that a full diagnosis of a leader's style requires more detail on their intentions, decision-making, and actions. Furthermore, whether a leader is perceived by their followers as transformational or pseudo-transformational may be unrelated to their actual intentions. One can be perceived as having negative intentions, for example, because a previous leader did so, even though the current leader may not. We ask students to reflect on the degree to which they believe the exercise has contributed to their ability to recognize that leadership is seldom all good or bad, and that follower perceptions matter.

After engaging in this exercise, we asked students in an undergraduate Organizational Behavior course to provide feedback. Most found the activity to be valuable for deepening their comprehension of transformational leadership. Many reported not only an enhanced understanding but also a significant improvement in retaining their knowledge. In addition, students appreciated the exercise's practical application, finding it both engaging and interesting. This was further evidenced by their high satisfaction with the experiential activity, highlighting its effectiveness as an educational tool in teaching the potential limitations or dark sides of transformational leadership.

Conclusion

Understanding transformational leadership and being able to recognize pseudo-transformational behaviors are crucial skills for students. The case of Holmes is an opportunity for students to apply transformational leadership concepts to a contemporary example. Feedback from students indicates this activity both aids in understanding the topic and engages them in the learning process such that their knowledge retention is enhanced, as is their satisfaction.

Appendix A

Detailed Description of Transformational Leadership

Transformational leadership is a leadership style that achieves outstanding performance by inspiring and motivating followers (Bass & Riggio, 2006). Specifically, this style focuses on vision, inspiration, and the development of followers' potential. Transformational leaders engage with their followers in a way that elevates both parties to higher levels of motivation and morality.

Four factors of transformational leadership are as follows:

Idealized influence reflects a leader's adherence to strong ethical standards, positioning them as a role model for their followers (Bass & Riggio, 2006). Those leaders exhibit high ethical standards and lead by example, earning respect, trust, and admiration from their followers (Cetin & Kinik, 2015). Their behavior sets a benchmark for followers, creating a culture of trust and ethical conduct.

- Example: A leader (e.g., Martin Luther King) who demonstrates an unshakable commitment to ethical practices, even in challenging situations, thereby gaining the trust and loyalty of their team.

Inspirational motivation involves inspiring and energizing followers, for example, by communicating a compelling vision. Transformational leaders use persuasive and enthusiastic communication to instill a sense of purpose and meaning in their followers' work (Bass & Riggio, 2006). They set high expectations and encourage followers to envision the future positively, fostering a shared sense of goals and objectives.

- Example: A leader (e.g., Indra Nooyi, retired CEO of PepsiCo) who communicates a vivid vision of the future, such as transforming the company into an industry leader/world changer, and motivates employees by highlighting the importance of their roles in achieving this vision.

Leaders use *intellectual stimulation* to encourage innovation and creativity among followers, prompting them to think critically and propose novel solutions to problems. Transformational leaders actively seek out innovative ideas and alternative methods of accomplishing tasks (Cetin & Kinik, 2015).

- Example: A leader (e.g., Diane von Furstenburg, founder and chairperson of the firm that bears her name) who encourages team members to think creatively, explore innovative technologies, and develop inventive solutions to complex problems, fostering a culture of continuous improvement and learning.

Individualized consideration encompasses an empathetic approach toward understanding and addressing the needs and emotions of followers. Transformational leaders function as mentors or coaches, providing personalized support, encouragement, and feedback.

- Example: A leader (e.g., John Wooden, revered UCLA basketball coach, “the dean of college basketball”) who holds regular one-on-one meetings with team members to discuss their career goals and development plans, offering guidance, training opportunities, and constructive feedback to help them achieve their personal and professional objectives.

Appendix B

Video Example 1

Video name: Youngest Self-Made Female Billionaire Takes a High-Tech Approach to Blood Testing

Video clip: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=UiNFXcI9Rb8>

Video duration: 5 to 6 minutes

At the time of this interview, Theranos and Elizabeth Holmes were in the midst of a high-profile fundraising period; therefore, this video is an excellent introduction to Holmes's leadership style. In addition, this video introduces the nature of Theranos's business and its operations, providing valuable insights for those who have limited knowledge about the company. Although the video does not show details of how Holmes influences her employees on a daily basis, it demonstrates several important characteristics of Holmes's leadership style. From the beginning of this video, Holmes's big vision for her company and its new blood testing technology are emphasized. Her mission is to change the health care industry and make blood tests affordable for everyone. From 0:51 to 1:09 minutes, she states that being the youngest billionaire in the world does not matter to her, and "what matters is how well we do in trying to make people's lives better. That's why I am doing this. That's why I work the way I work, and that's why I love what I'm doing so much." By communicating the big vision and displaying a genuine concern for societal impacts over personal interests, Elizabeth Holmes demonstrates the *idealized influence* characteristic of her leadership style.

Holmes further exemplifies the *intellectual stimulation* characteristic of transformational leadership by daring to challenge a traditional approach in the health care industry and pioneering groundbreaking blood testing technology. From 1:14 to 2:34 minutes, the video discusses the invented blood testing technology, which can detect different diseases by collecting a small amount of blood using a pin prick to the finger instead of using a needle to the arm. The company also claims its technology is a faster and cheaper alternative to the long-standing traditional process. When Holmes is questioned about the new technology, she responds, "Every time you create something new, there should be questions. And, to me, that's a sign that you've actually done something that is transformative."

From 3:25 to 5:18 minutes, the video portrays the *inspirational motivation* characteristic of Holmes's leadership style. Notably, she graces the covers of esteemed magazines and wields considerable influence within the health care field on a global scale. As the youngest self-made female billionaire at the time and a member of the prestigious Horatio Alger Association, Holmes's achievements serve as powerful motivation for young girls, inspiring them to shatter the glass ceiling and pursue their dreams of making a positive impact in the world. Furthermore, it is intriguing to witness the comparisons drawn between Holmes and iconic figures such as Bill Gates and Steve Jobs, who have long been revered as innovative and inspiring leaders. This association further underscores the remarkable impact of Holmes's endeavors and her potential to become a transformative force in her own right.

Video Example 2

Video name: Theranos CEO Elizabeth Holmes: Firing Back at Doubters | Mad Money | CNBC

Video clip: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=rGfaJZAdfNE>

Video duration: 9 to 10 minutes

By the time of this video, Holmes and Theranos are facing severe criticisms and widespread questioning regarding their new technology. The primary focus of this video centers on Holmes's responses to the scathing article titled "Hot Startup Theranos Has Struggled With Its Blood-Test Technology," which was prominently featured in the Wall Street Journal. The video delves into the concerns surrounding Theranos's technology, which, in turn, transfers the discussion to concerns with Elizabeth's leadership. By examining Holmes's reactions to the critical article, the video underscores the profound doubts raised about the reliability and effectiveness of Theranos's innovative blood test technology and subsequently brings attention to the broader implications of Holmes's ability to lead the company effectively. Importantly, how Holmes responds to questions vividly exemplifies the key characteristics of transformational leadership.

From 0:41 to 1:13 minutes, the host raises the first question based on the Wall Street Journal article, which claims that only a small fraction of Theranos's tests (15 out of the 240 tests) were conducted on their proprietary diagnostic machine (the Edison), while the rest were evaluated using traditional lab equipment. In response, Holmes refutes the claim, asserting that the Wall Street Journal has been provided with extensive documentation, consisting of over a thousand pages, to demonstrate the inaccuracy and misleading nature of the information.

Through her responses, Holmes exhibits *idealized influence* by projecting herself as a leader who is dedicated to making a positive impact on society and transforming the field of diagnostics. She emphasizes that the questioning of their new technology is a natural consequence of striving to bring about meaningful change. This approach seeks to inspire confidence and trust in her followers, urging them to believe in her vision and Theranos's mission to revolutionize health care. Moreover, her display of *inspirational motivation* is evident as she passionately conveys the belief that Theranos's efforts are aimed at improving the lives of people and causing a paradigm shift in the health care industry. By framing the challenges and doubts as an integral part of their journey to create positive change, Holmes tries to motivate her audience and stakeholders to rally behind her and the company's cause.

From 2:53 to 3:10 minutes, when questioned about rumors concerning Theranos's partnerships with drugstore chains like Walgreens and Cleveland Clinic, Holmes responds with unwavering confidence and faith. She explains the collaborations with Walgreens and highlights that its tests have received approval from the Food and Drug Administration (FDA). Throughout her responses, she continuously reinforces the idea that they are working toward transformative change in the health care industry, and she attributes any negative reactions to the natural resistance encountered when people attempt to disrupt the status quo.

Video Example 3

Video name: Elizabeth Holmes & The Theranos Deception| 60 Minutes Archive

Video clip: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jIqF95qiQSS>

Video duration: 14 to 15 minutes

This video shows students how pseudo-transformational leaders may behave similar to transformational leaders but with selfish rather than other-focused goals. Students hear from insiders how Theranos covers invalidated blood testing results for patients, presents faked demonstrations for company visitors, and pressures employees to engage in unethical behaviors.

From 1:12 to 2:01 minutes, the video sheds light on how Holmes initially garnered support and fame for her vision. Comparisons to Steve Jobs and the reference to her invention as the “iPod of health care” elevate her status to that of a celebrity. However, as the video progresses, we are exposed to darker aspects of her leadership. From 2:11 to 6:59 minutes, several former employees of Theranos share their experiences, exposing the deception prevalent within the company. For example, Tyler Schultz, who initially believes in Holmes’s vision, discovers that the Edison machine, purported to perform various medical tests with just a painless finger prick, is flawed and produces inaccurate results. Another former employee, Doug Matchy, corroborates Schultz’s account and expresses concerns about Holmes misleading Walgreens and investors with false information, saying, “when I was there, we could not complete any test accurately on the devices that we were manufacturing in 2000.” The video further reveals how Holmes instructed employees to stage demonstrations for investors, presenting a fairy tale rather than the actual technology. A third employee, Erica Chung, sees plenty of faulty test results go to Walgreens patients as they start to pick more patient samples. When they retest, there are often contradictory results. This misleading approach extends to claims of collaborations with reputable institutions like Johns Hopkins Hospital, which turns out to be false. The pressure imposed by Holmes and Theranos on employees is immense, leading to the falsification of test data presented to the FDA. Under pressure from Holmes and Theranos, Doug Matchy states that the test data he compiles for the FDA are falsified. He goes to his boss and claims this is not right. However, his boss is pressured to make everyone happy by accepting and using falsified data. Later, Doug Matchy quits his job.

Holmes’s leadership characteristics have been widely observed by her employees. Tyler Schultz said that “she just really idolized him [Steve Jobs], so she wore the black turtleneck. I think she created a world where she was Steve Jobs.” Holmes was obvious in her attempt to emulate Steve Jobs, fostering a perception of herself as a visionary leader in the mold of the renowned Apple co-founder. This idolization of Jobs, coupled with her actions, created an environment where she was perceived as a larger-than-life figure. However, the positive perceptions ceased when former employees, like Tyler Schultz, reported the company’s fraudulent practices to regulators, leading to the collapse of Theranos and subsequent legal charges against Holmes.

While Holmes publicly stated her goal was to revolutionize blood testing and make it more accessible, it becomes evident through the revelations in this video that her ultimate motives were celebrity status and personal wealth. The video serves as a cautionary tale, shedding light on the potential dangers of pseudo-transformational leadership and the possible consequences of leaders prioritizing personal gain over the well-being of their followers and the broader community. It underscores the importance of ethical leadership and the need for genuine transformational leaders who

inspire and empower others for the collective benefit rather than their own self-interest, even when their aspirations prove unattainable.

Appendix C

Example Description

In January 2022, Elizabeth Holmes, the founder of Theranos, awaited sentencing on her conviction of defrauding investors. She faced up to 20 years in federal prison, plus millions in fines. Holmes was found guilty on four counts of defrauding investors: three counts of wire fraud and one count of conspiracy to commit wire fraud by lying to investors to raise money for her company. Specifically, Holmes engaged in faked demonstrations, falsified test reports, misleading claims, and inflated financials. Theranos, a health care technology company, claimed that its blood tests could detect a variety of ailments with just a few drops of blood without the need for expensive lab work (Griffith & Woo, 2022). According to the evidence presented by prosecutors, Theranos did not have the technology to evaluate various ailments, leading patients to get unreliable test results. Before disclosing this scandal, Theranos received more than 700 million in investment funding from media mogul Rupert Murdoch, former Education Secretary Betsy DeVos, and the Walton family of Walmart fame (Dickler, 2021). Theranos was recognized as a prime example of a health care start-up. Holmes received the Under 30 Doers Award from Forbes and was ranked number 73 in its 2015 list of “the world’s most powerful women.”

Holmes was viewed by many as a transformational leader. In an interview with USA Today in 2014, Holmes shared the business story of Theranos. She explained her motivation was to help people who are afraid of needles and try to avoid doing blood tests. In addition, she was a visionary. In her talk, Holmes said,

My own life’s work in building Theranos is to redefine the paradigm of diagnosis away from one in which people have to present with a symptom in order to get access to information about their bodies to one in which every person, no matter how much money they have or where they live, has access to actionable health information at the time it matters.

She was skilled at communicating her business vision and mission and expressing the confidence of her company to achieve the goal. Holmes once said, “I wanted to talk about what this company could do a year from now, five years from now, 10 years from now” (Griffith & Woo, 2022). She reiterated that Theranos’s proprietary technology could take a pinprick’s worth of blood extracted from the tip of a finger—a remarkable innovation that was going to save millions of lives and “change the world,” a phrase she often repeated.

Holmes used her charisma to win over investors and world leaders. From 2013 to 2015, she was feted with awards and glowing magazine cover stories and praised as the world’s “youngest self-made female” billionaire. However, a journalist discovered

that Theranos did not use its own “developed” technology but relied on other companies’ technology (Carreyrou, 2015). In addition, Theranos’s own blood sampling technology was not as accurate as Holmes had claimed. Hundreds of pieces of evidence show that Holmes knowingly misled investors and patients on her rise to fame and fortune.

Trial evidence demonstrated that Holmes knew the analyzer was not producing accurate and reliable results. Holmes understood it could only perform a few basic tests and was slower than existing devices. Holmes also misrepresented the dire financial status of Theranos to investors and its prospects for future earnings. As a result, Holmes was sentenced to over 11 years in prison for defrauding investors.

Appendix D

Discussion Questions

Question 1. After learning the four factors of transformational leadership, can you think of a real-life example of a transformational leader? Why do you think the leader is transformational?

Question 2. Video 1. How does Holmes’s leadership style reflect the four factors of transformational leadership?

Idealized influence

Inspirational motivation

Intellectual stimulation

Individualized consideration

Question 3. Video 2. Based on the video (or written material), are there any elements of Holmes’s leadership style that concern you? Why or why not?

Question 4. Video 3. What are some possible limitations and/or dark sides of transformational leadership as observed in Holmes’s leadership?

Declaration of Conflicting Interests

The authors declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

Funding

The authors received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

ORCID iD

Junnan Cui  <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2175-9510>

References

Avolio, B. J., Zhu, W., Koh, W., & Bhatia, P. (2004). Transformational leadership and organizational commitment: Mediating role of psychological empowerment and moderating role

- of structural distance. *Journal of Organizational Behavior: The International Journal of Industrial, Occupational and Organizational Psychology and Behavior*, 25(8), 951–968. <https://doi.org/10.1002/job.283>
- Bailey, J., & Axelrod, R. H. (2001). Leadership lessons from Mount Rushmore: An interview with James MacGregor Burns. *The Leadership Quarterly*, 12(1), 113–121. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1048-9843\(01\)00066-2](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1048-9843(01)00066-2)
- Barling, J., Christie, A., & Turner, N. (2008). Pseudo-transformational leadership: Towards the development and test of a model. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 81(4), 851–861. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10551-007-9552-8>
- Bass, B. M. (1985). *Leadership and performance beyond expectations*. The Free Press.
- Bass, B. M. (1999). Two decades of research and development in transformational leadership. *European Journal of Work and Organizational Psychology*, 8(1), 9–32. <https://doi.org/10.1080/135943299398410>
- Bass, B. M., & Riggio, R. E. (2006). *Transformational leadership*. Psychology Press. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781410617095>
- Bass, B. M., & Steidlmeier, P. (1999). Ethics, character, and authentic transformational leadership behavior. *The Leadership Quarterly*, 10(2), 181–217. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1048-9843\(99\)00016-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1048-9843(99)00016-8)
- Berk, R. A. (2009). Multimedia teaching with video clips: TV, movies, YouTube, and mtvU in the college classroom. *International Journal of Teaching and Learning*, 5(1), 1–21.
- Boyd, B. L. (2009). Using a case study to develop the transformational teaching theory. *Journal of Leadership Education*, 7(3), 50–59.
- Burns, J. M. (1978). *Leadership*. Harper & Row.
- Carreyrou, J. (2015, October 16). Hot Startup Theranos has struggled with its blood-test technology. *The Wall Street Journal*. <https://www.wsj.com/articles/theranos-has-struggled-with-blood-tests-1444881901>
- Carreyrou, J. (2018). *Bad blood: Secrets and lies in a silicon valley startup*. Knopf.
- CBS Mornings. (2015, April 16). *Youngest self-made female billionaire takes high-tech approach to blood testing* [Video]. YouTube. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=UiNFXcI9Rb8>
- Cetin, M. O., & Kinik, F. S. F. (2015). An analysis of academic leadership behavior from the perspective of transformational leadership. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 207, 519–527. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.10.122>
- Christie, A., Barling, J., & Turner, N. (2011). Pseudo-transformational leadership: Model specification and outcomes¹. *Journal of Applied Social Psychology*, 41(12), 2943–2984. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1559-1816.2011.00858.x>
- CNBC. (2015, October 16). *Theranos CEO Elizabeth Holmes: Firing back at doubters| mad money* | CNBC [Video]. YouTube. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=rGfaJZAdfNE>
- Derue, D. S., Nahrgang, J. D., Wellman, N. E., & Humphrey, S. E. (2011). Trait and behavioral theories of leadership: An integration and meta-analytic test of their relative validity. *Personnel Psychology*, 64(1), 7–52. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1744-6570.2010.01201.x>
- Dickler, J. (2021, September 10). The lessons for investors from the trial of Theranos founder Elizabeth Holmes. *CNBC*. <https://www.cnbc.com/2021/09/10/the-lessons-for-investors-from-the-trial-of-theranos-founder-elizabeth-holmes.html#:~:text=Nearly%20a%20decade%20ago%2C%20investors,Theranos'%20blood%2Dtesting%20technology>
- García-Morales, V. J., Jiménez-Barrionuevo, M. M., & Gutiérrez-Gutiérrez, L. (2012). Transformational leadership influence on organizational performance through organizational learning and innovation. *Journal of Business Research*, 65(7), 1040–1050. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2011.03.005>

- Granitz, N., Kohli, C., & Lancellotti, M. P. (2021). Textbooks for the YouTube generation? A case study on the shift from text to video. *Journal of Education for Business, 96*(5), 299–307. <https://doi.org/10.1080/08832323.2020.1828791>
- Griffith, E., & Woo, E. (2022, July 8). Elizabeth Holmes trial Elizabeth Holmes found guilty of four charges of fraud. *The New York Times*. <https://www.nytimes.com/live/2022/01/03/technology/elizabeth-holmes-trial-verdict>
- Howell, J. M., & Avolio, B. J. (1993). Transformational leadership, transactional leadership, locus of control, and support for innovation: Key predictors of consolidated-business-unit performance. *Journal of Applied Psychology, 78*(6), 891–902. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0021-9010.78.6.891>
- Liao, H., & Chuang, A. (2007). Transforming service employees and climate: A multilevel, multisource examination of transformational leadership in building long-term service relationships. *Journal of Applied Psychology, 92*(4), 1006–1019. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0021-9010.92.4.1006>
- Lin, C. S., Huang, P. C., Chen, S. J., & Huang, L. C. (2017). Pseudo-transformational leadership is in the eyes of the subordinates. *Journal of Business Ethics, 141*(1), 179–190. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10551-015-2739-5>
- O'Reilly, C. A., & Chatman, J. A. (2020). Transformational leader or narcissist? How grandiose narcissists can create and destroy organizations and institutions. *California Management Review, 62*(3), 5–27. <https://doi.org/10.1177/000812562091498>
- Pieterse, A. N., Van Knippenberg, D., Schippers, M., & Stam, D. (2010). Transformational and transactional leadership and innovative behavior: The moderating role of psychological empowerment. *Journal of Organizational Behavior, 31*(4), 609–623. <https://doi.org/10.1002/job.650>
- Seemiller, C., Grace, M., Campagnolo, P. D. B., Alves, I. M. D. R., & De Borba, G. S. (2020). What makes learning enjoyable? Perspectives of today's college students in the US and Brazil. *Journal of Pedagogical Research, 5*(1), 1–17. <https://doi.org/10.33902/JPR.2020065267>
- 60 Minutes. (2022, January 3). *Elizabeth Holmes & The Theranos Deception* [Video]. 60 Minutes Archive. YouTube. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jIqF95qiQSs>
- Varma, V. (2020). Developing change readiness: A video-based classroom exercise. *Management Teaching Review, 5*(1), 20–31. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2379298118822497>
- Wang, G., Oh, I. S., Courtright, S. H., & Colbert, A. E. (2011). Transformational leadership and performance across criteria and levels: A meta-analytic review of 25 years of research. *Group & Organization Management, 36*(2), 223–270. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1059601111401017>
- Williams, J., & Rosser, M. (2008). Teaching leadership using popular media: Alternative formats to reach the millennial generation. *Journal of Leadership Education, 7*(2), vii–viii.